

Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy

2012 Annual Performance Report

Northeast Ohio Four County Regional Planning and
Development Organization

Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy

Annual Performance Report 2012

Prepared by:

Northeast Ohio Four County Regional Planning and Development Organization

March 2012

The preparation of this document was financed in part through a grant from the U.S. Department of Commerce, Economic Development Administration and through contributions from the dues-paying members of the Northeast Ohio Four County Regional Planning and Development Organization.

Table of Contents

	<u>Page</u>
List of Tables	iii
List of Appendices	iii
Mission Statement.....	iv
Introduction.....	1
Meeting 2011 Agency Goals for Economic Development.....	2
Meeting 2011 CEDS Goals.....	4
Status of the NEFCO Region.....	6
Economic District	6
Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats	7
2012 Priorities for Economic Development	11
2012 Goals and Objectives	12

List of Tables

<u>Table</u>	<u>Page</u>
1 Unemployment Rates in Selected NEFCO Region’s Cities	6
2 2012 CEDS Priority Public Works Projects	11

List of Appendices

<u>Appendix</u>	<u>Page</u>
A NEFCO’s Regional CEDS Committee	14
B Project Scores and Selection Criteria for Public Works (construction) and Economic Adjustment (non-construction) Projects	16

NEFCO's Economic Development Planning Vision Statement

NEFCO's regional economic development planning program strives to grow the region's economy through collaborative planning efforts with NEFCO's area governments and by providing assistance in activities that:

- *Promote a diversified and sustainable economy*
- *Support the most economically distressed areas of the region*
- *Capitalize on the region's existing strengths and assist with efforts to promote innovation and technology*
- *Ensure the efficient use and development of land and resources*

Introduction

The NEFCO region is slowly recovering from the recent economic recession, partly sustained by the start-up of activity in automobile plants and the area's manufacturing infrastructure. The region, however, is also experiencing secondary effects of the economic recession. The initial blow to individuals through job losses or housing foreclosures, has extended to the region's local governments. Moreover, the State of Ohio has begun to drastically reduce funds to local governments, with plans for a 50 percent decrease in 2013. Many area governments, struggling to reduce expenditures while maintaining services to their residents, must address problems with unemployment, a reduced tax base, and abandoned or idle properties, knowing full well of the greater reliance of their communities on governmental services.

After a strong performance in 2010, with several EDA investments made in the region, many EDA recipients spent 2011 organizing and carrying out these funded activities. Some awardees took the time to build coalitions, expanding their areas of influence, while other local governments took actions to strengthen fiscal conditions. These measures often led to inadequate time and resources to pursue EDA grants. Although 2012 has only recently begun, there appears to be a renewed interest in and ability to pursue in federal funds to assist with local economic development projects. Perhaps this interest is one indication of an economic recovery in Northeast Ohio.

The value of regional planning is heightened under these economic conditions. Limited resources require careful thought in determining how to gain the most impact. The 2012 *Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy Annual Performance Report* describes the region's current economic climate -- hopeful but cautious -- and the potential projects identified to facilitate economic recovery.

Meeting 2011 Agency Goals for Economic Development

NEFCO met its stated agency goals for economic development planning for 2011.

1. **Anticipate changes needed to NEFCO's CEDS process to implement new CEDS reporting requirements.** NEFCO received board approval to expand its Regional CEDS committee to include Wayne County representatives who are valuable to the process as well as allow for similar non-government members to represent other NEFCO member jurisdictions.
2. **Work to move eligible Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy (CEDS) projects to the application stage and review by EDA.** In a year when local entities had limited resources, NEFCO continued to monitor the progress of the region's projects with the highest potential for EDA assistance and provided letters of support for applications seeking state funds. One project, NorTech's Speed-To-Market Accelerator, received an EDA Jobs and Innovation Acceleration Challenge award of over \$2 million.
3. **Continue to learn about and integrate the new EDA project selection and review process with NEFCO's CEDS process.** NEFCO underwent training in new reporting requirements and met all of EDA's requirements. Staff informed interested parties of EDA deadlines, initiatives and priorities.
4. **Work with the City of Twinsburg and Summit County to meet grant requirements for the Chrysler Twinsburg Economic Recovery Strategy.** NEFCO completed work on a recovery strategy in October after reviews and positive feedback from economic development planners in Summit County communities and a state economic development organization research analyst.
5. **Accept the Summit County Brownfields Coalition grant if offered by USEPA; work with coalition members on next steps.** The 2010 application request was not funded. We received feedback on our application and re-applied in November 2011.
6. **Participate in appropriate web seminars to improve NEFCO's strategic economic development planning process.** Staff participated in relevant webinars related to brownfields, economic statistics, and regional economic development planning.
7. **Continue to be a member of the northeast Ohio Regional Prosperity Initiative's (RPI) Land Use Committee.** NEFCO staff continues to be an active member of this committee and also attends meetings of the RPI's Steering Committee.
8. **Become a member of the Northeast Ohio Consortium for a Regional Plan for Sustainable Development (a.k.a. the HUD grant).** With NEFCO Board approval, NEFCO staff submitted the necessary paperwork for NEFCO to become a Consortium member. Staff regularly attends Consortium Board meetings, as well as Environments and Economic Development workstreams meetings. Staff also reports to the Board on the Consortium's activities.
9. **Assist Census Bureau and members with 2010 decennial census and related data releases.** Staff informed communities and the Board of new data releases throughout 2011,

and provided help with accessing and navigating the complex website for Census 2010 and American Community Survey data.

10. **Upgrade economic development planning hardware.** A new computer was purchased in March 2011.
11. **Publish quarterly newsletters.** Newsletters were published for three quarters, which included a combined Fall/Winter newsletter in early 2012.
12. **Launch new website location and content.** NEFCO developed and launched a new website, which includes information on economic development programs, links to current Census data, NEFCO's reports (including the *Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy*), and other useful data.

Meeting 2011 CEDS Goals

Goal 1: To promote diversification of the local and regional economies

2011 was a fiscally difficult year for many local governments. Staff conducted interviews with dues paying members' economic development staff to discuss statistical analysis performed for the region and to learn of challenges and opportunities facing these communities. The result of these interviews was the verification/identification of a community's strong existing and emerging industries. This activity allowed members to track their progress toward diversification and business retention for the industrial sector. Participation in JumpStart, Inc.'s Regional Advisory group, which is assessing regional gaps and making recommendations to promote entrepreneurship, will facilitate economic diversification.

Goal 2: To assist in the efficient use and development of land

Staff continued involvement in the 16-county Regional Prosperity Initiative's Land Use Committee will allow NEFCO to provide expertise and collaborate with other land use planners on more efficient and effective development.

Of the 15 public works projects identified as priorities in NEFCO's *2012 CEDS*, at least seven projects represented either a brownfield redevelopment or land/building reuse. Additionally, one of these projects is located on site of a former auto plant, which received EDA funds for a recovery strategy in 2010. NEFCO's selection criteria used to rank projects encourages the use of a brownfield site or building renovations over developing greenfields.

Goal 3: To ensure local support for the project

All projects that were recommended to the EDA for funding had the support of the local government in which they were located. Furthermore, all projects represented a partnership between either a local government or eligible non-profit group and the private sector.

Goal 4: To encourage programs that reinforce workforce development

Because the level of economic distress is a priority for determining how best to use limited resources, NEFCO continued to calculate per capita income and 12- and 24-month unemployment figures for all of NEFCO's counties, Ohio and the U.S. Additional statistics were prepared for the Cities of Akron, Barberton, Cuyahoga Falls, Kent, Massillon, Stow, and Wooster. These calculations indicated the communities in greatest need of financial assistance. However, other entities also received assistance from NEFCO staff, and the economic conditions in the region as a whole were monitored for changes that would make them eligible for EDA funds. New EDA-funded initiatives in 2011 included an award to NorTech for the Jobs and Innovation Accelerator Challenge, which includes a workforce training component.

Goal 5: To encourage the development of industries that support Northeast Ohio's targeted industries

Incorporating the targeted industries identified in the State of Ohio's strategic plan for development, NEFCO focused regional economic development planning efforts on those which appeared to be present in the four counties that we serve. Projects identified in the *2010 CEDS Update* report were expected to build on one or more of the following targeted industries:

- Advanced Energy and Environmental Technologies
- Aerospace and Aviation
- Agriculture and Food Processing
- Bioscience and Bioproducts
- Corporate and Professional Services
- Distribution and Logistics
- Instruments, Controls, and Electronics
- Motor Vehicle and Parts Manufacturing
- Polymers and Advanced Materials

The completion of the Economic Recovery strategy for the Chrysler Stamping Plant provided more recent data on industry clusters, many of which are still Ohio's targeted industries. Information from the plan will assist the region's economic development planners through the identification of industrial strengths and weaknesses.

Goal 6: To ensure project readiness

Staff regularly inquired with potential applicants about the readiness of their projects. However, economic conditions have created tight budgets, and very few communities have local matching funds for EDA grants. Some have applied for state grants, which, if awarded, will be the basis for an application for EDA programs. Staff also met or spoke with several potential applicants to determine eligibility and whether there was a good fit between a project and EDA's funding priorities. NEFCO provided technical assistance to Barberton Community Development Corporation for its project awarded in 2010. The project faced a potential award retraction from EDA. Staff participation in a conference call assisted with the submission of a project revision that resulted in the reinstatement of the project in EDA's funding pipeline.

Status of the NEFCO Region

Economic Distress

Most of the NEFCO region's communities showed slight economic improvements over the past year. However, local governments still face the challenge of the economic recession, and recovery has been slow. A survey of the most recent 24-month unemployment rates indicates pockets of distress in the region. The Cities of Barberton, Canton and Massillon and Stark County are more than one percentage point above the national average of 9.3 percent (January 2010 through December 2011). When evaluating the per capita income of NEFCO's communities, several locations in the region fall below 80 percent of the national average including Akron, Barberton, Canton, Kent, Massillon, and Stark County. Statistics for larger cities and NEFCO's counties are listed; however, the most recent American Community Survey data provides per capita income figures for other communities. Some of the smaller cities in the region, such as Hiram and Ravenna, are within non-distressed counties but they exhibit low per capita incomes that meet EDA's criteria for distress. Akron and Canton, the only cities for which the American Community Survey portrays one-year estimates, are characterized by even lower PCI than the three-year estimate. Although Summit County's statistics do not indicate distress by EDA's standards, the impact of the Chrysler Stamping plant closure continues to affect the region. The loss of highly skilled workers in the region and the erosion of wages is not reflected in unemployment statistics.

Government	24-month Percent Unemployment⁺ Bureau of Labor Services	Average Annual Unemployment 2010 (2011 data not available) Bureau of Labor Services	Per Capita Income (% of U.S.) 3-year estimate, American Community Survey, 2008-2010	Eligibility for EDA Assistance (Per Capita Income, Unemployment, Other)
Akron	10.0	10.6	74.1	PCI
Barberton	10.9	11.6	70.3	PCI, Unemp.
Canton	11.8	12.5	62.3	PCI, Unemp.
Kent	5.5	7.9	68.3	PCI
Massillon	10.9	11.4	70.6	PCI, Unemp.
Wooster	8.2	8.8	92.8	None
Portage County	9.2	9.8	91.3	None
Stark County	10.5	11.3	83.8	Unemp.
Summit County	9.3	9.9	94.2	Other
United States	9.3	N.A.	-	

+ Rates calculated on February 22, 2012.

Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities & Threats

Strengths

- Census 2010 numbers indicate that, although the Greater Cleveland-Akron area has lost population, it remains a major market that can serve as a “significant regional center” and is the most populated census-defined area in Ohio (Plain Dealer, 5/29/11).
- Rust belt states are recovering more quickly from the recession than the rest of the United States. This pattern is also true for Ohio (Plain Dealer, 1/31/12). Northeast Ohio’s manufacturing strengths have helped to pull it out of the recession faster than most of the rest of the state and the nation (Plain Dealer, 11/14/11).
- Area universities have undertaken significant roles in economic development. Kent State University houses NEOTEC, public-private enterprise involved in regional economic development (Kent State Magazine, Spring 2011). University of Akron’s University Park Alliance is involved with redevelopment efforts surrounding the university and downtown Akron. A study in 2011 revealed a \$2.5 billion economic impact of major institutions near the neighborhood, and an indirect impact of \$3.5 billion within Ohio (Beacon Journal, 4/27/11). The partnership between Akron and the University Park Alliance drew praise from former secretary of U.S. Housing and Urban Development Henry Cisneros (Beacon Journal, May 12, 2012). Governor Kasich praised Stark State University as a model for how higher education institutions can partner with local businesses. Stark State trains students selected from high schools by Timken Company, which provides employment for them while they are attending the university (Beacon Journal, 4/22/11).
- The Akron metropolitan area is ranked the top 10 best places in the U.S. to find a job, according to *The Fiscal Times* (Beacon Journal, 12/6/11).
- The University of Akron has received Department of Defense funds to build the nation’s first bachelor’s degree program in corrosion engineering (Beacon Journal, 5/12/11).
- A high-tech start-up company, Akron Polymer Systems, opened its headquarters and laboratory on the University of Akron’s campus. This company is the first to locate in Akron’s Biomedical Corridor (Beacon Journal, 5/1/11).
- The City of Kent received a \$20 Federal Transit Administration award to fund the Kent Central Gateway Multi-Modal Transit Center, and is in the process of a major redevelopment of its downtown area (Beacon Journal, 4/20/11).
- New construction on Goodyear Tire & Rubber and Bridgestone company headquarters continues in Akron. They are expected to be completed in early 2012 (Bridgestone) and in 2013 (Goodyear) (Modern Tire Dealer – The Biss List, 12/20/11).
- The Northeast Ohio Trade and Economic Consortium (NEOTEC) will be marketing two Foreign Trade Zones, one which was initiated by NEFCO. Having the two programs under the administration of one entity gives the region one of the largest trade zones in the country with a combined total of 11,000 acres (Beacon Journal, 1/18/12).
- American Community Survey data show that Northeast Ohio is the most ethnically diverse area of the state (Plain Dealer, 10/27/11).
- A JumpStart, Inc. study notes that 90 small companies in the Greater Akron-Cleveland region helped support 1,115 jobs and nearly \$154.4 million in economic activity in 2010 (Plain Dealer, 10/6/11).
- The City of Canton attracted a call center, bringing 1,000 jobs within three years (Canton Repository, 6/8/11).

- The City of Wooster ranked among the Top Ten in two categories (Business Friendliness and Cost Effectiveness) in “American Cities of the Future.” Wooster was the only Midwestern city on the list, which was compiled by fDi Magazine (Wayne Economic Development Council, 7/1/11).
- The Wooster/Wayne County micropolitan area was named one of the top six micropolitans in the nation for business growth, moving up from 4th place to 2nd between 2010 and 2011 (*Site Selection magazine*, Wayne Economic Development Council, March 1, 2012).
- The Ohio Agricultural Research and Development Center has opened its plant and animal agrosecurity facility, one of only two in the nation that combine plant and animal agrosecurity research (Beacon Journal, 9/6/11).
- Northeast Ohio has become a food exporter (a \$2.6 billion industry), and many of the companies responsible for this strength are located in NEFCO’s counties (Plain Dealer, 2/13/12).

Weaknesses

- Economic development professionals point to a weakness within the region (and possibly the country) finding qualified workers for jobs. There is a need for workers with a strong work ethic and with education in science, technology, engineering and math
- Although the region is undergoing economic recovery, its communities still struggle with low performance, partly based on how productivity is measured (Plain Dealer, 6/28/11).
- An analysis of companies that received economic development incentives in 2010 showed that many did not created the promised number of jobs (Akron News Now, 12/29/11). On a related note, Summit County’s did not win its claim that Chrysler violated two tax abatement deals. The county had hoped to recover \$7.9 million from the company (Beacon Journal, 12/14/11).
- The State of Ohio has been slow in approving funds used for Tax Increment Financing, placing cities like Akron in a difficult fiscal situation (Beacon Journal, 1/7/12).
- The area lost another trucking company as YRC announced plans to sell the former Roadway headquarters in Akron, eliminating 50-100 jobs (Beacon Journal, 1/6/12).
- Despite documentation of the easing of the economic downturn in Stark County, American Community Survey 2010 data show that the county continues to face a recession and has not recovered to its pre-recession levels. Canton’s poverty rate was unchanged in Fall 2011. More than half of the children in Canton live in poverty (Canton Repository, 9/22/11). Census Bureau statistics indicate that incomes and home values continue to decline in the Akron-Canton area (Beacon Journal, 12/8/11).
- Newell Rubbermaid closed its distribution center in Wooster, ending Rubbermaid’s association with the city, which housed the former Rubbermaid headquarters (Beacon Journal, 11/14/11).
- Akron is one of the Rust Belt metropolitan areas that saw an increase in poverty among residents in 2010, according to Census Bureau statistics (Beacon Journal, 11/3/11).

Opportunities

- NorTech’s Advanced-Energy roadmap initiative has been identifying clusters of interconnected businesses, suppliers, service providers and institutions that build on Northeast Ohio’s current economic strengths. NorTech has also pointed out the region’s assets and opportunities in fuel cells, offshore wind, solar, nuclear, shale gas, clean coal

and energy efficiency. An action plan to promote clusters in energy storage, biomass/waste-to-energy and smart grid is being implemented (Plain Dealer, 6/26/11).

- Current Utica shale drilling activity in Ohio may contribute significantly to the domestic oil market. Portage and Stark Counties have received much attention from drilling companies due to their potential for this energy resource.
- Ohio's new privatized economic development organization, JobsOhio, anticipates quicker, more effective responses to the private sector as a result of closed-door sessions to finalize deals (The Daily Record, 1/31/12)
- Public-private collaborations include Timken Company and Stark State College's \$11.8 million wind turbine research and development center for emerging technologies (Plain Dealer, 5/24/11). Kent State University research has identified more than 240 collaborative projects that are in progress or being explored in a 16-county region of Northeast Ohio (Beacon Journal, 6/2/11).
- Akron's Biomedical Corridor continues to attract interest and companies (Beacon Journal, 3/23/11). The city announced a new \$1.5 million fund to attract and establish biomedical companies that focus on orthopedics, wound healing, cardiovascular science, the use of biomaterials and medical information technology, and the development of medical devices (Beacon Journal, 10/26/11).
- JumpStart, Inc.'s expanded program in the NEFCO region (as part of the JumpStart Inc's America Initiative) will target women and minority entrepreneurs, and will focus on areas where there is a gap between business development services and actual investments made in early stage companies.
- Akron has received some attention from Hollywood actor and director Corbin Bernsen, who in addition to filming in Akron, has developed a project with the help of the University of Akron's Research Foundation with plans to base it in Akron (Beacon Journal, 12/1/11).
- Stark County has begun a land bank with the goal of returning tax-delinquent properties to productive use. The program could hasten the turnaround of abandoned properties to new owners (Beacon Journal, 2/30/11).
- The return of manufacturing jobs to the U.S. could transform the region, which already has the skills and infrastructure for this start-up. Suarez Corp. relocated 250 jobs from China to North Canton's former Hoover Co. facility (Vindy.com, 1/30/12).
- Hudson unveiled the only environmentally-friendly industrial park in Ohio to house green businesses (Beacon Journal, 10/13/11).
- Summit County is the first county in Northeast Ohio to receive the designation of an Alternative Energy Zone. The designation will allow tax breaks to companies engaged in renewable and alternative energy activities (Beacon Journal, 8/29/11).

Threats

- Delays in the formation and operationalization of the state's privatized economic development agency, JobsOhio, may lead to loss of confidence in this new form of doing business in Ohio. Communities that already have economic development operations are concerned that JobsOhio's structure will add another layer (albeit a potentially more nimble private sector) to their attraction/retention efforts. Critics maintain that attracting large companies accounts for only 2% of state job growth in the nation, and that nearly all job gains come from expansion of existing businesses or creation of new businesses (Beacon Journal, 1/23/11).

- Research performed for an economic recovery strategy revealed a low “Economic Dynamics” score, indicating that entrepreneurship, business start-ups, broadband connectivity, and large company location could be improved. Research also found that not enough high-tech related degrees are being granted in the region, which also suffers from a lack of high-tech job opportunities (Twinsburg Chrysler Stamping Plant Recovery Action Plan (draft), 2011).
- Vacant homes have put neighborhoods in danger of obsolescence and depress home values. Cities need funding to demolish abandoned homes and to restore decaying neighborhoods and population losses (Plain Dealer, 1/29/12).
- The lack of sufficient resources to repair roads, bridges and highways has resulted in cancellations of critical projects such as I-76 reconstruction in Akron/Barberton (Beacon Journal, 1/19/12).
- The arguments surrounding the redrawing of congressional districts divide political parties and voters during a time when cooperation is necessary (Beacon Journal, 9/15/11).
- A highly successful program for brownfield redevelopment, Clean Ohio, was to end this year. However, it will now receive funds from JobsOhio. Without this funding source, local governments would have faced challenges in redeveloping contaminated sites, and the region may have experienced development of greenfields farther away from the existing infrastructure (Ohio Environmental Law Blog, 4/15/11). The level of funding may be subject to the success of JobsOhio (Beacon Journal, 1/29/12).
- Local governments face severe reductions in funds from the State of Ohio. In early 2012, the governor announced a 25% cut in local government funds. In 2013, a 50% reduction will take place (2012 State of the City Address, Don Plusquellic, Mayor of Akron).

2012 Priorities for Economic Development

The following projects have been identified as NEFCO’s priorities for economic development. Appendix B contains the scores of each project and the selection criteria used to rate them. The region’s economic development priorities are presented in two tiers. Tier I projects are those which have the highest priority.

2012 CEDS Priority Public Works Projects		
Tier I Projects (listed alphabetically)	Location/ Applicant	NEFCO Member
Atlantic & Great Western Research & Discovery Park	City of Kent	Kent
BioHio Research Park	City of Wooster/OARDC	Wooster
Biomedical Incubator	City of Akron	Akron
Hartville Wastewater Treatment Plant	Village of Hartville	Stark
NE Canton Industrial Park	City of Canton	Canton
Tier II Projects (listed alphabetically)	Location/ Applicant	NEFCO Member
Ametek Property	City of Kent	Kent
Brimfield Township Water Line	Brimfield Twp.	Portage
CAK International Business Park, Phase III at Port Green	City of Green	Summit
Hartville Industrial Park Infrastructure	Village of Hartville	Stark
Hartville Water Line Extension	Village of Hartville	Stark
Mats Road Bridge	Village of Mantua	Portage
Ravenna Township Water Line	Ravenna Twp.	Portage
Weatherchem Rail Spur	City of Twinsburg	Summit
UNRANKED – TO BE UPDATED		
Faircrest/I-77	City of Canton	Canton
Stark Ceramic	City of Canton	Canton
<i>Additional projects may be added by the Cities of Akron, Kent, Wooster; and Summit County</i>		

2012 Goals and Objectives

In order to respond to the new priorities of the EDA and to recognize the changing directions of the regional economy, NEFCO has made revisions to the goals that frame its regional economic development planning efforts. The CEDS Committee has approved the following goals and objectives which factor heavily in setting the region's priorities for economic development. These goals and objectives are used for selecting projects for the Regional Projects (unranked) List and for assessing the ranked projects in their importance to the region.

Goal 2012-1: To promote diversification of the local and regional economies

Objectives:

- Provide for the increase of basic jobs
- Encourage programs and projects that create and retain jobs
- Support technology and entrepreneurial development
- Support efforts that will make the region more globally competitive

Goal 2012-2: To assist in the efficient use and development of land and resources

Objectives:

- Encourage the use of brownfield sites
- Support projects that are consistent with a general plan of the appropriate unit of government
- Support projects that preserve greenspace, either through innovative design or through measures taken to ensure more compact development
- Support economic development possibilities tied to the local food industry and activities that improve the local food infrastructure
- Support collaborative efforts in order to reduce duplication in services and resources

Goal 2012-3: To promote economic activities that have the support of NEFCO's members

Objectives:

- Encourage projects and activities that have obtained the support of the appropriate local government(s)
- Whenever possible, promote projects that represent a public/private partnership and a high return on investment

Goal 2012-4: To encourage programs that will positively affect the most distressed parts of the region

Objectives:

- Promote projects in areas where the unemployment rate meets or exceeds the state's unemployment rate
- Promote projects where the per capita income is 80 percent or less than the national average
- Project proposes activities that will train and educate economically disadvantaged individuals
- Promote projects in an Enterprise Community/Empowerment Zone or other federal or state priority area

Goal 2012-5: To encourage the development of industries that support Northeast Ohio's targeted industries

Objectives:

- Support projects that contribute toward strengthening the region's targeted industries adopted from the State of Ohio's *Strategic Plan* (2008).
- Support activities that complement targeted as well as other existing industries in the region.

Appendix A

NEFCO's 2012 Regional CEDS Committee

**2012 Regional Comprehensive Economic Development
Strategy Committee**

- Chair: Jim Currie, Ohio Agricultural Research and Development Center
- City of Akron: Member: Brent Hendren, Mayor's Office of Economic Development (appt. July 23, 2007)
Alternate: Vacant
- City of Canton: Member: Linda Barnes, Canton Community Improvement Corporation (appt. January 14, 2011)
Alternate: Vacant
- City of Kent: Member: Dan Smith, Dept. of Community Development (appt. Aug. 25, 2008)
Alternate: Bridget Susel (appt. January 10, 2012)
- City of Wooster: City Coordinator: Justin Starlin, Economic Development
Member: Justin Starlin (appt. December 2010)
Alternate: Vacant
- Portage County: County Coordinator: Todd Peetz, Regional Planning Commission (appt. July 12, 2010)
Member: Brad Ehrhart (appt. October 6, 2011)
Alternate: Charlene Badger (appt. 2008)
- Stark County: County Coordinator: Brenda Sarsany, Regional Planning Commission (appt. 2003)
Member: Robert Nau, Regional Planning Commission (appt. 2001)
- County of Summit: County Coordinator: Erin Siebel (appt. 2011)
Member: Dennis Tubbs, Dept. of Community and Economic Development (appt. January 11, 2012)
Alternate: Susan DeChant, Dept. of Community and Economic Development (appt. 2002)
- Other*: Rod Crider, Wayne Economic Development Council (appt. 2006)
Jim Currie, (appt. 2005)

*NEFCO is in the process of expanding the committee to include additional members representing chambers of commerce, institutions of higher education, or non-profit organizations.

Appendix B

Project Scores and Selection Criteria for Public Works (construction) and Economic Adjustment (non-construction) Projects

2012

NEFCO Scoring Sheet for CEDS Priority List Projects

Construction Projects

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	TOTAL	Rank
Portage County															
Brimfield Twp. Water Line	1	2	0	6	3	2	0	3	0	3	0	6	0	26	12
Mats Road Bridge -- Mantua Village	1	10	0	6	0	2	0	0	5	3	0	2	1	30	11
Ravenna Twp. Water Line	1	2	0	6	3	2	0	3	0	3	0	6	0	26	12
City of Kent															
Ametek Property	8	10	0	6	3	2	4	3	0	3	1	2	1	43	9
Atlantic & Great Western R & D Park	8	10	5	6	3	6	4	3	5	3	3	6	3	65	1
Stark County															
Hartville WWTP	8	10	0	6	3	2	0	0	5	3	6	12	3	58	2
Hartville Industrial Park Infrastructure	8	10	0	3	3	2	0	0	5	3	0	10	1	45	7
Hartville Waterline Extension	8	10	0	3	3	2	4	3	5	3	3	2	1	47	6
City of Canton															
NE Canton Industrial Park	8	10	1	6	3	2	4	3	5	3	1	6	4	56	4
Stark Ceramic	UNRANKED--TO BE UPDATED														
Faircrest/I-77															
County of Summit															
CAK International Business Park, Phase III at Port Green	1	10	0	6	3	2	0	0	5	3	0	10	4	44	8
Weatherchem Rail Spur- Twinsburg	1	10	0	6	3	2	4	0	0	3	3	0	1	33	10
City of Akron															
Biomedical Incubator	8	10	5	6	3	2	4	3	5	3	1	2	1	53	5
City of Wooster															
BioHio Research Park	1	10	5	6	3	4	4	3	5	3	6	8	0	58	2

The cities of Akron, Kent and Wooster, and Summit County may select additional projects to rank in the future.

2012 Economic Adjustment Priority List

CEDS Priority CEDS Projects – Economic Adjustment, 2012											
Project	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	Total
Twinsburg Industrial Property Assessed Clean Energy District	1	10	5	6	3	0	5	6	1	5	42

Although the project scores are presented in these tables, NEFCO promotes the Tier I projects as having equal prioritization for the purposes of consideration for EDA funding. Readiness to proceed with a project is often a deciding factor in funding preferences.

**CEDS Selection Criteria for EDA Construction Projects
2012**

1. Unemployment rate. The purpose of the Economic Development Administration (EDA) is to create and/or retain private sector jobs and to alleviate unemployment and underemployment. Projects located in areas of high unemployment receive more points. Unemployment for the most recent 12-month period using U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) will be calculated, when possible, for the entity or county in which the project is located. Small communities that are not covered by BLS statistics may provide independent studies for the Committee to consider in assigning points.

Unemployment rate greater than 1 percentage point above the U.S. rate /area has per capita income of 80 percent or less than the national PCI	8 points
Unemployment rate less than or equal to 1 percentage point above the U.S. rate	5 points
Unemployment rate equal to the U.S. rate	3 points
Unemployment rate less than or equal to 1 percentage point below the U.S. rate	1 point
Unemployment rate greater than 1 percentage point below the U.S. rate	0 points

2. EDA funds requested will be used to:

Build or renovate a facility for manufacturing/ industrial/business incubator use or construct infrastructure to directly serve a manufacturing/ industrial development/expansion	10 points
Build or renovate a facility for office/ service/information technology use	6 points
Build or renovate a facility for a retail/commercial use	2 points
Construct infrastructure to directly serve a retail/commercial development/expansion	2 points
Construct or support an infrastructure/ transportation project as part of a general road network (not solely serving a development)	2 points
Build or renovate a community facility	0 points

3. EDA’s National Strategic Priorities. EDA has identified a set of national priorities. Projects that address these priorities will receive one point for each, up to a maximum of 5 points. Documentation is required in order to receive a point.
 - a. Clean energy
 - b. Green technologies
 - c. Sustainable manufacturing
 - d. Information technology infrastructure (where lacking) – for eg. Broadband, smartgrid
 - e. Auto industry restructuring
 - f. Natural disaster mitigation
 - g. Access to capital for small to medium-sized and ethnically diverse enterprises
 - h. Innovations in science, healthcare and alternative fuel technologies

4. How many full-time jobs are expected to be created and/or retained by the project over the next 9 years? (i.e. do not count part-time or contractual jobs).

50 jobs or more	6 points
Up to 49 jobs	3 points

5. Quality of Jobs Created. The average hourly base wage rate of the jobs created (excluding benefits) is at or above 200% of the federal minimum wage.

3 points

6. Environmental considerations. Assign 2 points for each criterion met below:
 - Project will tap into or link to existing infrastructure that is between 0 to ½ mile from the site.
 - Project design goes beyond basic permitting, building or zoning requirements to incorporate or preserve an environmental or historic feature on the site.
 - Project involves the adoption of and adherence to Leadership in Environmental and Energy Design (LEED) guidelines.

7. Reuse of land or buildings. Project is located on a brownfield site or promotes reuse of an existing facility. Brownfields are defined by ORC 122.65 as “abandoned, idled, or under-used industrial, commercial or institutional property where expansion or redevelopment is complicated by known or potential releases of hazardous substances or petroleum.” Presence of brownfield must be documented to receive the points.

4 points

8. Cooperation. Project represents a partnership between 2 or more eligible applicants as defined by 13 Code of Federal Regulations, section 300.2 (for example, a local government, community development corporation or a university). A partnership is characterized by the commitment of money or in-kind services.

3 points

9. The project contributes to Ohio’s Statewide Targeted Industries, as identified in A Strategic Plan for the Ohio Department of Development. Projects will receive 5 points for identifying a potential tenant or client engaged in activities below. Projects will not receive any points for this item unless an applicant can identify a potential tenant, community plan or client that proposes specific activities that would fit into these categories (based on the intended/planned construction). For retention projects, consider this question on the basis of known contributions to Ohio’s Statewide Targeted Industries.

- a. Advanced Energy and Environmental Technologies
- b. Aerospace and Aviation
- c. Agriculture and Food Processing
- d. Bioscience and Bioproducts
- e. Corporate and Professional Services
- f. Distribution and Logistics
- g. Instruments, Controls, and Electronics
- h. Motor Vehicle and Parts Manufacturing
- i. Polymers and Advanced Materials

0 or 5 points

10. Local coordination. Project being proposed is in accordance with the local plan of the area in which it is located (plan must be submitted in order for committee to determine whether or how many points are to be awarded).

3 points may be awarded as determined by the Regional CEDS committee

11. Local support. Local share is essential to the development of a project. High priority will be given to projects which have a high percentage of local participation as a portion of total project costs. In kind contributions must be specified. Do not include staff time.

Calculate:
$$\frac{\text{Local share (in-kind , public, private funds)}}{\text{Total Project Costs}}$$

- | | |
|----------------|----------|
| 70% or greater | 6 points |
| 50 - 69% | 3 points |
| 30 - 49% | 1 point |
| less than 30% | 0 points |

12. Planning completed. Give the project two points for each step already completed in the following planning process, and be prepared to provide documentation.

- a. Land/Building acquisition/Title acquired
- b. Engineering design studies completed
- c. Availability/completion of necessary environmental studies
- d. Construction plans drawn
- e. Plans approved by appropriate government agency
- f. Local match promised
- g. Local match secured

Total number of points _____

13. Readiness to proceed. Many projects are listed in the CEDS, but are in various stages of their readiness to proceed with the EDA application. Priority is given to projects that are closer to applying to EDA for funding. Please use realistic measures when scoring.

Application already submitted and project is listed in NEFCO's CEDS	12 points
Actively working with NEFCO to submit application within 1-3 months	4 points
Actively working with NEFCO to submit application within 4-6 months	3 points
Expect to submit application within 6-12 months	1 point
Not sure when application will be submitted	0 points

**CEDS Selection Criteria for EDA Economic Adjustment (Non-Construction) Projects
2012**

1. Unemployment rate. The purpose of the Economic Development Administration (EDA) is to create and/or retain private sector jobs and to alleviate unemployment and underemployment. Projects located in areas of high unemployment receive more points. Unemployment for the most recent 12-month period using U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) will be calculated, when possible, for the entity or county in which the project is located. Small communities that are not covered by BLS statistics may provide independent studies for the Committee to consider in assigning points.

Unemployment rate greater than 1 percentage point above the U.S. rate /area has per capita income of 80 percent or less than the national PCI	8 points
Unemployment rate less than or equal to 1 percentage point above the U.S. rate	5 points
Unemployment rate equal to the U.S. rate	3 points
Unemployment rate less than or equal to 1 percentage point below the U.S. rate	1 point
Unemployment rate greater than 1 percentage point below the U.S. rate	0 points

2. EDA funds requested will be used to:

Directly support the industrial/manufacturing sector	10 points
Directly support high tech/innovation industries	10 points
Support plans related to infrastructure/transportation projects that are directly related to creating high-tech, high quality jobs	10 points
Support businesses that will primarily be involved in the service industry or information technology	6 points
Support businesses that are primarily retail/commercial	2 points
Support plans directly related to stand-alone infrastructure/transportation projects unrelated to the creation of high quality jobs	2 points
Support plans for a community facility	0 points

3. EDA’s National Strategic Priorities. EDA has identified a set of national priorities. Projects that address these priorities will receive one point for each, up to a maximum of 5 points. Documentation is required in order to receive a point.
 - a. Clean energy
 - b. Green technologies
 - c. Sustainable manufacturing
 - d. Information technology infrastructure (where lacking) – for eg. Broadband, smartgrid
 - e. Auto industry restructuring
 - f. Natural disaster mitigation
 - g. Access to capital for small to medium-sized and ethnically diverse enterprises
 - h. Innovations in science, healthcare and alternative fuel technologies

4. How many full-time jobs are expected to be created and/or retained by the project over the next 9 years? (i.e. do not count part-time or contractual jobs).

50 jobs or more	6 points
Up to 49 jobs	3 points

5. Quality of Jobs Created. The average hourly base wage rate of the jobs created (excluding benefits) is at or above 200% of the federal minimum wage.

3 points

6. Cooperation. Project represents a partnership between 2 or more eligible applicants as defined by 13 Code of Federal Regulations, section 300.2 (for example, a local government, community development corporation or a university). A partnership is characterized by the commitment of money or in-kind services.

3 points

7. The project contributes to Ohio’s Statewide Targeted Industries, as identified in A Strategic Plan for the Ohio Department of Development. Projects will receive 5 points for identifying a potential tenant or client engaged in activities below. Projects will not receive any points for this item unless an applicant can identify a potential tenant, community plan or client that proposes specific activities that would fit into these categories (based on the intended/planned construction). For retention projects, consider this question on the basis of known contributions to Ohio’s Statewide Targeted Industries.
 - j. Advanced Energy and Environmental Technologies
 - k. Aerospace and Aviation
 - l. Agriculture and Food Processing
 - m. Bioscience and Bioproducts
 - n. Corporate and Professional Services
 - o. Distribution and Logistics
 - p. Instruments, Controls, and Electronics
 - q. Motor Vehicle and Parts Manufacturing
 - r. Polymers and Advanced Materials

0 or 5 points

8. Local support. Local share is essential to the development of a project. High priority will be given to projects which have a high percentage of local participation as a portion of total project costs. In kind contributions must be specified. Do not include staff time.

Calculate:
$$\frac{\text{Local share (in-kind, public, private funds)}}{\text{Total Project Costs}}$$

70% or greater	6 points
50 - 69%	3 points
30 - 49%	1 point
less than 30%	0 points

9. Readiness to proceed. Many projects are listed in the CEDS, but are in various stages of their readiness to proceed with the EDA application. Priority is given to projects that are closer to applying to EDA for funding. Please use realistic measures when scoring.

Application already submitted and project is listed in NEFCO's CEDS	12 points
Actively working with NEFCO to submit application within 1-3 months	4 points
Actively working with NEFCO to submit application within 4-6 months	3 points
Expect to submit application within 6-12 months	1 point
Not sure when application will be submitted	0 points

10. The project is submitted by a NEFCO member or by a community represented by NEFCO.
5 points